#### Nomination form International Memory of the World Register

Boril's Synodicon or Synodicon of King Boril (Palauzov's Copy)

2014-19

### 1.0 Summary (max 200 words)

The Boril's Synodicon is the key document testifying about the anti-Bogomil Synod, convened by King Boril in 1211 in Tarnovo (Bulgaria). Compiled on the occasion of the Council, revised at the reign of Ivan Assen II and complemented in the late fourteenth century at the time of Patriarch Euthymius, it is a unique testimony of the official attitude against the heresies in Medieval Europe and of the liturgical use of this specific political and religious instrument in the medieval Slavic societies, as it influenced the Serbian and Russian redactions of the Synodicon. Dated to the reign of Ivan Shishman (1371–1395), it contains *polyhronia*, not known from other sources, to him, Queen Maria and Patriarch Euthymius. Besides the anathemas against priest Bogomil's and other heretical teachings, the book contains beadrolls of high historical value with the names of Bulgarian rulers and clerics. According to its liturgical purpose, the copy is supplied with the unique Coronation Rite of a Queen. In addition to its historical importance, the bilingual manuscript serve in witness of the cultural influence of Byzantium, especially by its unique notated texts, a priceless testimony of spreading the Byzantine melismatic chant in the Balkans in the Middle Ages.

### 2.1 Name of nominator (person or organization)

National Memory of the World Committee at the Minister of Culture of the Republic of Bulgaria

2.2 Relationship to the nominated documentary heritage

The St. St. Cyril and Methodius National Library of Bulgaria as a state cultural institution of national importance with its Director is the holder of the document

2.3 Contact person(s) (to provide information on nomination) Prof. DSc Boryana Hristova, Dr. Elena Uzunova

### 2.4 Contact details

Name

Address

**Boryana Hristova, Director,** St. 88 Vasil Levski Blvd, 1037 Sofia, Bulgaria St. Cyril and Methodius National Library of Bulgaria

# Elena Uzunova, Archivist,

Manuscripts and Old Printed Books Department at the St. St. Cyril and Methodius National Library of Bulgaria Telephones

+ 359 2 9183 101

+ 359 2 9881600;

+359 2 9183 165

Facsimile + 359 2 8435495 b.hristova@nationallibrary.bg

eluzbg@yahoo.com

# 3.0 Identity and description of the documentary heritage

### 3.1 Name and identification details of the items being nominated

If inscribed, the exact title and institution(s) to appear on the certificate should be given Boril's Synodicon (Synodicon of King Boril, Palauzov's Copy), NBKM 289, is a fragment of a manuscript, which originated from the literary circle around Euthymius, the last Bulgarian Patriarch before the fall of the Second Bulgarian Kingdom under the Ottomans. There are missing leaves at the beginning of the manuscript, the end and elsewhere. The manuscript has been restored. The original cover is detached from the book block, but the fragmented parts of boards and ornamented leather are preserved. The manuscript decoration consists of modest headpieces, composed of scribal marks and red Neo-Byzantine initials with foliate ornament. The Slavic orthography of the manuscript belongs to the two-jer and two-jus Tarnovo School orthography. The content includes the Slavic translation of the Constantinopolitan version of Byzantine Synodicon of 843 and the Horoi (definitions, decisions) of the Sixth and Seventh Ecumenical Councils, with numerous interpolations made by the Bulgarian compilers, the Synodicon of King (Tsar) Boril of 1211 (original non-extant) at first place. Four of possibly five notated chants written in Greek and Bulgarian precede the survived text and are supplied with liturgical glossae, indicating that "here singers are singing in voice". This is an important testimony that the instructions are provided for professional singers. In this first part are included the anathemas against priest (pop) Bogomil's and other heretical teachings, some of which were contemporary to the fourteenth-century compilers of the copy. This fourteenth-century version of the original Synodicon of King Boril gained national importance by its beadroll of Bulgarian rulers and clerics. This register contains rich onomastic and historical evidences, in certain cases not known from other sources. The part proper to the Synodicon is followed by four rites -Coronation Rite with instructions for gueen coronation; prayer at the appointment of caesar and *curopalate*; a cycle of prayers at Pentecost; the Rite of Washing the Feet. The second part, starting with fol. 63r, comprises the horoi of the Ecumenical Councils, provided for liturgical use, with the acclamations (polychronia) for King Ivan Shishman, Queen Maria and Patriarch Euthymius. The third main part is in Greek and comprises fragments of the horoi of the Ecumenical councils. In the codex are preserved many Slavic and Greek notes (inscriptions) from different times.

## 3.4 History/provenance

During the 15<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> centuries, as testified by later notes in the manuscript NBKM 289, it was used mainly in Bulgarian ethnic territories. According to Michael Popruzhenko, the manuscript was gifted in 1845 to the Russian citizen and government official of Bulgarian origin Nikolay Hristoforovich Palauzov, by Stoyancho Penjuvich Achtar, dealer of pharmaceutical goods in Tarnovo (Bulgaria). Palauzov showed the historical document to Viktor Grigorovich, notable Slavicist and collectioner, who first reported about it in 1848, although he claimed that previously the manuscript had belonged to a priest from Sevlievo. When he came back to Russia, N. Palauzov gave the manuscript to his erudite cousin, Spyridon Palauzov, educated in Russia and also a Russian citizen, who was one of the first modern Bulgarian historians. In his papers published in 1851, 1855 and 1858 he referred to the manuscript and presented parts of its text. After his death in 1872, his relatives took care of his legacy and in 1878 N. Palauzov turned to Prof. Marin Drinov, the then Head of the Department of National Education and offered the library of his cousin to the newly established Sofia Public (later National)

Library. In 1878 Prince Dondukov-Korsakov, the Commissar of the Temporary Russian Governance in Bulgaria, provided funds to purchase the collection and in July next year it was delivered to the Library. The Synodicon was registered under No 55.

### 4.3 Legal status

The nominated manuscript is part of the national documentary heritage defined as "cultural values" by the Law on the Cultural Heritage in force from 10.04.2009. As such it has the status of a public state property, and is registered in the fonds of the St. St. Cyril and Methodius National Library. According to the Public Libraries Act in force from 6.07.2009 any library fond is a state or municipal property (Article 55 (1)) and within the rights of the National Library as a state cultural institution is to owner its documental funds.

The administrative responsibility for the manuscripts in the Slavonic and Foreign Language Collections in the Library is delegated to the Head of the Manuscripts and Old Printed Books Department.

The Ministry of Culture is the institution, which authorizes permission to loan items from the special collections of the Library to other institutions in the country and abroad.

# 4.4 Accessibility

As a public library the National Library provides free and equal access to its library holdings. However, the access to original documents, such as the Boril's Synodicon, is limited. This is estimated as necessary because of reasons of preservation; free access is permitted to the digital copy of the manuscript. Access to originals, including this one, is given with preference to students in their final BA and MA studies, doctoral students, and scholars, who are either supplied with letters of recommendation or have prominent academic status; under certain conditions, access is given also to common readers in case they can substantiate their need to investigate particular details of the document not visible on the microfilm or digital copy.

The original has shelf mark NBKM (H6KM) 289. The digital copy is in the Digital Library and could be found on the site of the National Library, in the section "The Bulgarian Fourteenth Century": <u>http://digital.nationallibrary.bg/DWWebClient/(X(1)S(an4elrskgtonzoibf35hsu3y))/Vie werWindow.ashx?WebpartKey=Viewer\_Viewer\_9378&v=1796</u>.

#### See

also: http://www.europeana.eu/portal/record/9200114/E51093BEF1289C6C14181BCD5B6EB BB0BEDF5D8C.html

http://www.theeuropeanlibrary.org/tel4/record/1000060518544?locale=de&providerid=P01268&view=about

http://www.pravenc.ru/text/153127.html

### 4.5 Copyright status

The National Library is the copyright holder of the special collections of manuscripts, archives and similar documents.

### 5.0 Assessment against the selection criteria

### 5.1 Authenticity.

The manuscript is a late fourteenth-century original, comprising a copy of a lost thirteencentury (1211) original. After the academic world in the nineteenth century had became aware of the existence of the manuscript, the investigations of renowned European Slavicists and historians proved its reliability as a historical source. The date and authenticity of the writing material were confirmed by the investigations of *Atanasova, N*. Observations filigranologiques sur les manuscrits bulgares du XIV<sup>e</sup> siècle de la Collection de la Bibliothèque nationale Cyrille et Méthode. – Palaeobulgarica, IX, 1985, № 2, p. 75, 102.

Its content and physical characteristics correspond in any detail to what has been described by the first scholars, who had studied the Boril's Synodicon. The identity of the late fourteenth-century scripts and Tarnovo orthography were confirmed by the researchers of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries on the basis of a comparative analysis with other works with proved affiliation to the Tarnovo Literary School, such as the Liturgicon of Patriarch Euthymius.

Nevertheless, the place of origin has not been exactly established as there is no written testimony about it. Tarnovo as a place of origin of the copy is a conjecture.

#### 5.2 World significance

The manuscript is the only authentic, even though not original, document of the anti-Bogomil Council convoked by the Bulgarian King Boril in 1211 in Tarnovo, the then capital of the Second Bulgarian Kingdom. It falls into the context of the common Christian dogmatic heritage and particularly in its history, concerning the origins and spreading of the heretical teachings with their great impact on the religious and everyday life

in different parts of Europe during the Middle Ages. In the preserved texts of anathemas against the Bogomils are mentioned not only the names of some of the most important leaders of the heresy of the Bogomils, but also some names unknown from other sources. The anathema against Basil the Physician (Vasilij Vrach) is not included into the Byzantine protograph of the book. The Bogomilism, on which there is a huge bibliography, see http://www.bogomilism.eu/, is a social and religious teaching, which emerged in Bulgaria in the first half of the tenth century, during the reign of King Peter (927-970). By its nature it is a teaching, which deviated from the norms of the Orthodox Church. The designations Bogomilism and Bogomils stem from the name of the founder of the heresy, priest (pop) Bogomil. Information about the Bogomils' views is found in their own works, as well as in the anti-Bogomil writings. One of the important sources about their beliefs and rites is the Synodicon of Boril, together with others, like the presbyter Cosmas' Sermon Against the *Heretics*, the vitae of St Hilarion of Meglen, St Theodosius of Tarnovo, St Stefan Nemanja. The concepts of the Bogomilism are related to the dualistic beliefs of the Massalians and Paulicians, spread in the territory of the Byzantine Empire. There is only scarce information about the Bogomils' organization in the tenth and eleventh centuries, but in the mid-tenth century the heresy assumed the shape of an organized and rapidly spreading movement. It is suggested that priest Bogomil was killed in one of the persecutions initiated by the authorities of the First Bulgarian Kingdom. During the Byzantine rule over the Bulgarian lands (1018-1186) the Bogomilism gained vast popularity and reached Constantinople and Athens. The most famous court prosecution against the Bogomils was held in c. 1111-1115 in Constantinople at the reign of Alexius I Comnene. The Bogomil Basil the Physician was condemned and burnt alive. After the establishment of the Second Bulgarian Kingdom in the context of the spreading of the Bogomil and Cathar heresies to and in the West, King Boril convoked the council against the Bogomils in 1211. A new upheaval of the heresy in the next century at the time of Tsar Ivan Alexander (1331–1371) was related to the names of the Bogomil leaders Cyril Bosota and priest Stefan, both anathemised by the Tarnovo council in

1350. During the Ottoman rule (1396–1878) the Bogomil movement subsided and after the sixteenth century the name Bogomils was replaced by this of the Paulicians. The Bogomil heresy has been influential in the Byzantine Empire until the fifteenth century. In Asia Minor these heretics were called Phundagiagites (torbeshi) and Bogomils, in medieval Bosnia they were known as Babuns, and as Patarenes or Kudugers, in Serbia. In the twelfth and thirteenth centuries the Bogomil heresy, according to various scholars, penetrated in Northern Italy and South France, where it inducted the Cathar and Albigensian heresies. What is certainly confirmed by the sources is that in the thirteenth-century in Italy and France the name of Bulgarians (bougres, bugres, bulgares) were associated with hereticsdualists. The Bogomil heresy proved to be one of the significant social and religious currents in medieval Europe. Its origins in the East, development through the centuries and impact on religious and cultural processes in Southern, Eastern and Western Europe in the Middle Ages is a controversial topic on which generations of scholars all over the world have focused and are focusing their studies. In this aspect one of the authentic documents to be considered is the Boril's Synodicon and respectively, its disappearance or damage will impoverish the heritage of the humanity.

Apart from its importance as a historical source, the manuscript is an authentic witness of the religious and cultural relations between Byzantium and Bulgaria in the late fourteenth century based on the official recognition of the Hesychast doctrine. The Greek text of the horoi of the Ecumenical Councils, included in the Palauzov's Copy, is an evidence for the work with the Greek sources, but yet more indicative are the four unique hymns, without parallels in the known Greek musical literature, notated according to the late-Byzantine music system, also called Koukouzelian. By this feature the Borils' Synodicon is a priceless source about the spreading in the Balkans of the Byzantine melismatic singing. What is even more important is that in all probability the revision of the four survived musical texts was made by Patriarch Euthymius, which turns the document into a witness of the adoption of the new tendencies in the Orthodox Balkan music first by the Tarnovo Literary and Hymnographic School and of the singing in Slavic/Bulgarian language. From there they were transmitted to west and north, as bilingual musical manuscripts appeared in Serbia in the fifteenth century and in Wallachia and Moldavia in the sixteenth century. The notated texts in the Boril's Synodicon are the earliest proof of the adoption in Bulgaria of the late-Byzantine (Koukouzelian) note-musical system and its spreading through the so called Second South Slavic Influence. The fourteenth century is also the time of spreading of various notated "political songs" - songs against heresies, against Manicheans, Barlaamites, etc. Thus in any respect the notated texts provide a documentary evidence of the most progressive, in their time, currents in the Balkan Orthodox music, a specific cultural idiom whose recent active study enriches the world knowledge of the European immaterial heritage.

### 5.3 Comparative criteria:

#### 1 Time

The manuscript is a production of a time, crucial for the destiny of the Bulgarian Kingdom and the development of its medieval literary tradition. In the last decades of the fourteenth century there was a great activity within the frames of Tarnovo Literary and Hymnographic School in which the key figure was Patriarch Euthymius, the last Bulgarian Patriarch until the liberation of the country in 1878. The School is representative for the Hesychast orientation of the Orthodox Church in the second half of the century. The official recognition of this monastic movement in 1351 at the Local Council of Blachernae (Constantinople) resulted in a considerable change of the liturgical rite, which since then has been observed by the East Orthodox world.

With the fall of Tarnovo and of the Second Bulgarian Kingdom in 1396 under the Ottomans, the political and cultural life of the former state changed completely, and the literary processes, whose development was interrupted at their peak, found realization beyond the Bulgarian frontiers, in the Wallachian and Moldavian principalities and in Russia in the next

#### two centuries.

### 2 Place

The document does not contain crucial information about localities, but of undoubted importance are the listed in the beadrolls Bulgarian medieval bishoprics, some of which do no longer exist. On the basis of the extra textual data (the inscriptions) one can reconstruct the geographic line of the possible travelling of the manuscript from the Bulgarian land to Serbia, Wallachia, Moldavia and back, thus inscribing the Palauzov's Copy in the continuum of the Orthodox Balkan community, which in the epoch of the religious confrontation with the Islam acquires specific cultural and identificatory traits.

### 3 People

Along with the two historical stories related to events at the time of two Bulgarian kings – Tsar Boril and Tsar Ivan Assen II, the manuscript contains beadrolls with the names of Byzantine and Bulgarian kings and gueens,

patriarchs, bishops, nobles and voivodes. Besides the familiar names of the most popular heretical teachings and their representatives, of special importance are the names of heretics not known from the Byzantine Synodicon or the Horoi of the Ecumenical Councils, such as Symon the Magician, Koukovrik Manes, Eusebius, Naucratius, and James, as well as the confirmation of the names of the Bogomils Tikhik, Emilian, Moses, Peter of Cappadocia – "dedets" of Serdica, Luke and Mandelei Rodobolski. In the beadrolls are listed names of historical persons unknown from other sources, such as Plenemir, a ruler from the First Bulgarian Kingdom.

The document's creation reflects the events of the ninth century (843), when the Orthodoxy was restored after the loonoclast crisis and the feast of Sunday of Orthodoxy was instigated. Since then the Synodicon has acquired the role of one of the most effective instruments for maintaining and strengthening the Orthodox faith, thus bringing to the union and self-identification of the people as Christians. In the same time the Synodicons, including the Boril's version, reflect the behaviour of the Christian medieval societies against the ideas of the "others" – they have been classified as heretical and regarded as a threat again the official institutions.

### 4 Subject and theme

The Synodicon is a liturgical book to be publicly read on the Sunday of Orthodoxy (First Sunday of Lent). In the Christian world the document is of supreme authority, defining the religious norms and generally classifying the members of the society according to their right or wrong attitude to the Church and State. It is also a "memory" document of the national contribution to the Christian tradition by the entries of "eternal commemoration", which praises the righteous deeds of the official representatives. The Palauzov's Copy is the earliest South Slavic extant copy of the translated Byzantine Synodicon and thus a valuable testimony of the Slavic issue of this document and its liturgical use. Along with the subject of Orthodoxy, "appropriated" by the story of the Bulgarian Council in 1211, there comes the Story of the Restoration of the Patriarchate of Tarnovo in 1235, which itself is another valuable historical source and literary work known also from the Boril's Synodicon. With the later supplements, comprising the anathemas against Barlaam of Calabria and Akindin the Byzantine, the Synodicon and its Bulgarian translation involve the actual theme of the Hesychasm, recognised as the ultimate Orthodox Christian doctrine.

According to Prof. Marijana Tsibranska-Kostova "... the translation and constitution of the Bulgarian Synodicon is a result of the anti-Bogomil Council held on the 11 April 1211 in the capital of the Second Bulgarian Kingdom. It is not simply another work, translated from Greek, of old Bulgarian literacy, but something much more. Supplemented with persons and events of the Bulgarian political and religious history, it is a monument of the Christian identity of the Bulgarian folk and state, which has documented their past and present up to the moment of the Synodicon's compilation. Thus we are confronted with an encyclopedia of Bulgarian

#### Christianity."

### 5 Form and style

By its physical form the Synodicon is a typical medieval codex written on paper. However, its intellectual content makes it an unique composition on the basis of the Constantinopolitan version of the Synodicon to which the Bulgarian compiler/s added extracts from other sources, at first place the Letter of Patriarch Cosmas (1075-81) against the Bogomils, and some more, not all of which are established. Within the form of the Byzantine Synodicon the Bulgarian version brings original details such as the extended anathemas against the Bogomils, the description of the Bogomils' rites on the Day of St John the Baptist, the anathema against Basil the Physician. The historical aspect of the Synodicon is underlined by the inclusion in it of the Story about the Restoration of Tarnovo Patriarchate, ascribing the great deed to King Ivan Assen II (1218–1241). Its earliest preserved copy is this in the Palauzov's Copy, but there is a scholarly opinion that the Story is a concise version of a lost Bulgarian work. From a literary point of view of the eulogy of the Bulgarian ruler is of special interest.

Regarding its liturgical purpose, the Bulgarian compiler/s have included into the Synodicon four rites, one of which is the unique Coronation Rite of a Queen, and two others – The Rite of Washing the Feet and the complex of prayers from the Rite on Pentecost, which, as some scholars claim, have ancient Byzantine prototypes whose investigation is still awaited. The inclusion of the last two is ascribed to their importance in the Hesychast ritual. The presence of this liturgical set gives argument to other scholars' claim that the copy of the Boril's Synodicon represents part of another liturgical book, known as *Arhierejski chinovnik*, that is a Liturgicon provided for archpriests in the Orthodox Church.

As a literary work the Boril's Synodicon is among the most representative examples of the achievements of the Tarnovo Literary and Hymnographic School by its language, orthography, calligraphic skills and neo-Byzantine stylistic of its decoration. In its function as the highest official book of the church and state it is one of the examples of the literary and liturgical reform, believed to have been conducted by Patriarch Euthymius and carried further by his disciples.

## 6 Social/ spiritual/ community significance:

The manuscript is evidence to important events and processes in the history of Orthodox Christianity as a world religion. Today it has lost its significance as a liturgical tool. Instead, during the centuries and especially in the times of the Ottoman rule, it gained great historical significance as an instrument of collective memory of the nation. Since the time of the Bulgarian National Revival up to now it has remained a historical source of paramount importance as proved by the unceasing scholar and common interest to the information, related to the medieval heresies and to the Bulgarian medieval political and ecclesiastical history, to the development of Bulgarian language and literature and of the Byzantine music. The Palauzov's Copy of the Synodicon is included in the secondary school and university programmes as one of the primary sources about the history of the Bulgarian state. It must be stressed also on the fact that three of the musical texts are transcribed in Western European notation and are being performed at concerts in Bulgaria and abroad. They are high professional compositions of exceptional artistic value, which have outlived their own time and nowadays are studied in the academies of music as unique works.

## 6.0 Contextual information

### 6.1 Rarity

The manuscript provides information lacking in the known sources or only partly identified. It concerns mainly personal names, but also texts such as the narrative of the anti-Bogomil Council in 1211, the Story of the Restoration of the Patriarchate of Tarnovo, the short story about Michael III and his mother Theodora, included into the list of Byzantine Emperors and others. The preserved stories about the Synod of 1211 and the restoration of the Patriarchate have a limited number of copies in the next centuries. From the latter there is known only one other copy of the sixteenth century.

### 6.2 Integrity

The text of the Bulgarian Synodicon is related to the Byzantine Synodicon to the Sunday of Orthodoxy, the letter of Patriarch Cosmas to the Metropolitan of Larissa, the Horoi of the Sixth and Seventh Ecumenical Councils and their later Byzantine redactions, as well as to the chronicles of Zonara and Michael Glykos. As a literary "genre" the Synodicon belongs to the group of miscellanea varia, comprising dogmatic works compiled by the men of letters in Byzantium (Mount Athos in particular), Bulgaria and Serbia in the second half of the fourteenth century.